Danish University Colleges

Om professionella aktörers musikpedagogiska definitionsmakt
en kulturhistorisk studie av samband mellan musikpedagogisk teori och definitionsmakt. Ph.d.-afhandling.
Uddholm, Mats

Publication date:
2012

Document Version
Pre-print: Det originale manuskript indsendt til udgiveren. Artiklen har endnu ikke gennemgået peer-review (fagfællesbedømmelse) og redigering.

Link to publication

Citation for published version (APA):

General rights
Copyright and moral rights for the publications made accessible in the public portal are retained by the authors and/or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

• Users may download and print one copy of any publication from the public portal for the purpose of private study or research.
• You may not further distribute the material or use it for any profit-making activity or commercial gain
• You may freely distribute the URL identifying the publication in the public portal

Download policy
If you believe that this document breaches copyright please contact us providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.
Comprehensive summary in English

About professional practitioners music-pedagogical Powers of Definition

A cultural-historical study about the connection between the Theory of Music Education and the Power of Definition

Mats Uddholm

Original title in Swedish;

Om professionella aktörers musikpedagogiska definitionsmakt – En kulturhistorisk studie av samband mellan musikpedagogisk teori och definitionsmakt
Abstract

About professional practitioners music-pedagogical Powers of Definition: A cultural-historical study about the connection between the Theory of Music Education and the Power of Definition

The aim of this thesis is to illuminate which role theories of music education can have in the dialectic between discourse and competence in the practice of music pedagogy. The thesis stems from a problem-oriented project that resulted in the formulation of the following research question: how can the connection between music education theory and the power of definition be described and problematized from a cultural-historical perspective using Vygotsky's thesis of Semiotic Thinking? In his research on the dual function of language Vygotsky makes a distinction between the usage of concepts and conceptualization. In this study this distinction has been crucial to determining the relationship between music education theory and the power of definition as practised in music pedagogy. The research project comprised a background study and three sub-studies. The focus of the background-study was the conditions for musical learning and development in persons with severe cognitive dysfunctions. The first sub-study dealt with how social workers in this area of special education conceptualise their view of music in relation to their understanding of music activities in their own practice. The second sub-study aimed to explore which concepts music-therapists use in their meta-reflections on musical situations in this area of special education. The purpose of the third sub-study was to formulate a theoretical perspective on the relationship between music education theory and the power of definition using Vygotsky's hypothesis of semiotic thinking. From the results and conclusions of the sub-studies it is possible to draw two overriding conclusions regarding the research question: first, that music education theory can be understood as a structural coupling between the power of definition that is embedded in music-pedagogical discourse as a whole, and the power of definition possessed by music pedagogues; second, that the development of the power of definition in the practice of music pedagogy is a creative process that in turn entails a critical questioning of music education theory.

Keywords: semiotic thinking, power of definition, music education theory, music-pedagogical competence, Vygotsky, internalization, intranalization.
Summary in English

About professional practitioners music-pedagogical Powers of Definition: A cultural-historical study about the connections between Music Education Theory and the Power of Definition

1 Introduction
The aim of this thesis is to achieve a greater understanding of the relevance of music education theory in relation to the dialectic that exists between discourse and competence in the practice of music pedagogy. The thesis stems from a problem-oriented research project in which the definition of the problem was continuously challenged, reformulated and clarified.

As a result of the problem-oriented process, semiotic thinking, music education theory and the power of definition emerged as the main concepts of the study. These concepts are linked by their different functions and the design of the study follows their development and definition as theoretical concepts.

Background
Behind this study is a long-term interest in the significance that music education theory may have for the teacher’s ability to create conditions propitious for musical learning and development. This problem is connected to the relationship between music-pedagogical competence and music-pedagogical discourse. During studies at The Danish University of Education, I explored how a music-pedagogical paradigm could be described and problematized by applying Vygotsky's theories about the dialectic between the psychological and social functions of language (Vygotsky 1987).

Through the study of Vygotsky's conclusions about the dual function of language, I became aware of the distinction between concept-use and conceptualization. This distinction is crucial to the connection between music education theory and music-pedagogical power of definition.

The research project
To avail myself of the opportunity to test Vygotsky's hypothesis of semiotic thinking in an empirical study, I applied for postgraduate studies at the Royal College of Music in Stockholm. The development of this theoretical perspective led to questions about how the authority of teachers is to be understood
in relation to musical action, competence and musical agency. From the research-process the power of definition emerged as that main concept which made it possible to formulate the paradox that had arisen but had not yet been conceptualised in the analysis of the empirical studies.

2 The Problem and its Context
The overall focus of the study is on the connections between music-pedagogical discourse and competence. The problem-oriented process resulted in the formulation of the following research question;

How can connections between music education theory and the power of definition be described and problematized from a cultural historical perspective using Vygotsky’s thesis of semiotic thinking?

The Paradox
With the term power of definition Ulrich Beck refers to how problems are dictated to the sciences as a result of the entire range of definitions and conditions that society employs. These definitions and conditions stem from a critique of science, which at the same time is a critique to which science itself contributes (Beck 2000). In the present study, this concept refers to the power of definition exercised by pedagogues as opposed to the power of definition generated and expressed in music-pedagogical discourses. These discourses include the demands and expectations of society as a whole on the purpose and performance of music activities.

The problem of the power of definition in music pedagogy may, with Kaare Pedersen's terminology, be described as a paradox founded on an anomaly (Olsen & Pedersen 1997). The anomaly is in the sense that the issue concerning the power of definition raised by Beck makes it possible to problematize music-teaching qualifications from a new perspective. The problem is paradoxical as the development of the discourse of music pedagogy can be understood as a direct consequence of the increasing competence of music pedagogues, whereas the result of the development of this discourse is that this competence is becoming steadily more constricted and questioned.

Operative Theory
The conceptualising and analysis of the paradox are made from a cultural-historical perspective using Vygotsky's hypothesis of semiotic thinking. This theoretical perspective may be described as the study’s operative theory. The analysis of the hypothesis is based on the system theory which underlies Vygotsky’s distinction between inter-psychological and intra-psychological systems. Here the question of semiotic thinking is limited to discursive

---

1 This concept is taken from Daniel Stern's discussion about Agency and Self Agency (Stern 1991).

2
forms of language and thinking. The theoretical perspective is therefore, primarily based on Vygotsky's discussion of verbal language development and function.

In the present study the paradox exists primarily in the question regarding the function of language in relation to the connections between music education theory and the power of definition. According to Vygotsky, the development of man's semiotic thinking is dialectically linked to man's use of language as a tool for communication and reflection. However, although human use of concepts and conceptualization are thus dialectically connected, it may be advantageous to study these two phenomena separately.

The formulation of the problem
The formulation of the research question was based on the synthesis of two different problems. The one problem was about the research question's theoretical approach. This belongs to the epistemological problem-field and was the basis for a theory-generating sub-study. The aim was to formulate a theoretical perspective on connections between music education theory and the power of definition using Vygotsky's hypothesis of semiotic thinking:

How can Vygotsky's hypothesis of semiotic thinking be interpreted and developed as a theoretical perspective on the connections between music education theory and the power of definition?

The other problem was related to the field of music education and it was the basis for three empirical sub-studies. One of these functioned as a background study. Its purpose was primarily to achieve a more nuanced picture of the prerequisites for musical learning and development in the target group. This target group, which consisted of people with severe cognitive dysfunctions, represented socio-cultural practice for the purpose of this research;

What characterises the conditions necessary for the development of musical learning and development in persons with severe cognitive dysfunction?

The first sub-study aimed to generate data about the significance conceptualization may have for the connection between music education theory and the power of definition as practised in the field of music pedagogy;

What relationship exists between perception of music among social workers in the special-pedagogical area, and the way they understand musical activities in their own practice?

The purpose of the second sub-study was primarily to generate data about which influence the use of music-education concepts may exert upon the
connection between music-educational theory and the power of definition as practised in the field of music pedagogy;

What concepts do music-therapists use in their meta-reflections on musical situations in special-education practice?

3 Theoretical Perspectives
The analyses of the sub-studies were conducted from a cultural-historical perspective based on Vygotsky's hypothesis of semiotic thinking. This construction consists of a synthesis of different perspectives drawing mainly on cultural-psychology and cultural-sociological theory.

The search for scientific articles and literature was performed by professional networks, and library services, Search Engine Google and the databases Academic Search Elite and Eric. Most attention has been devoted to issues connected to the research question and its main concepts.

The question about connections between music education theory and the power of definition in the field of music pedagogy has not been recognised in earlier research of music education. Nor has any corresponding research been devoted to pedagogical theory and the pedagogical power of definition.

References where the concept “semiotic thinking” is connected to Vygotsky are also relatively sparse. In the references found in literature in English, "linguistic thinking" is the most common translation of the term. A less widespread translation is "semiotic thinking." The translation "semiotic thinking" is, from my interpretation of Vygotsky, the most accurate because language is not only a verbal phenomenon.

From these searches it appears that Vygotsky does not yet occupy a prominent position in music-education research. The research question in this study, therefore, has no direct connection to earlier research.

4 Methodological and ethical proposals
The fashioning of the cultural-historical perspective presupposed a number of scientific-philosophical standpoints.

Ontological and epistemological considerations
In "The Web of Belief," Willard V Quine discusses how scientific hypotheses can be used both to explain the past as well as to predict the future. While the testing of hypotheses in different problem areas requires methods that generate different kinds of knowledge, it does not prevent us from perceiving all findings as hypotheses (Quine 1978). From this perspective, the hypothesis as such is interesting as it acquires its validity by being tested both against reality and against the logic of its implicit premises.

By using a hypothesis we can, in other words, create a synthesis of scientific experience and philosophical rationality. From a pragmatic point of view, the hypothesis should serve as a methodological tool in a science that
is constantly evolving through the dialectical process between belief and acceptance. Whether the theoretical framework or methodology is complete or not, it must be specified and developed in relation to earlier experiences and the purposes of the ongoing investigation. The theoretical frame of a thesis can thus be said to be the result of a form of methodological constructivism (Wallen 1996).

The understanding of reality is subjective, while reality exists objectively (Thisted 2009). From a dialectical-constructive perspective, the examination of reality therefore can be understood as a dialectical process between objective reality and subjective understanding of this reality. In practice this means that dialectic constructivism combines ontological realism with epistemological relativism.

The connection between these two aspects of scientific practice makes it possible to achieve scientific knowledge based on a pragmatic approach, without falling into subjectivism or objectivism. However, we can not understand, and thus criticise the pragmatic paradigm, until it is finally presented in the completed thesis.

*Ethical considerations*

All participants in the study are protected by anonymity. However, participants with significant cognitive dysfunctions presented a special problem. Because of their handicap, they were unable to be aware of their participation in the study.

The background study was based on musical activities that already exist. The pedagogues were informed about the design and purpose of the project and they had consented to it. The individual participant could leave the current activity on his own or the pedagogues' initiative. Thus, there was no risk that the study might have adverse psychological or physical consequences for the participants.

**5 The Cultural-Historical Perspective**

The paradigm was pragmatic, in the sense that it was designed to describe and problematize the relationship between music education theory and the power of definition. The construction of this paradigm and its limits were governed by the work involved in the empirical studies. The development of the hypothesis of semiotic thinking as a theoretical framework was the outcome of critical hermeneutic interpretation.

As a result of the theory-generating sub-study, the three main concepts were defined as follows:

*The definition of semiotic thinking*

Semiotic thinking can be described as the mental processes that occur in the synthesis of language and thought. In these thought processes language and thinking are dialectically opposed to each other. In communication, the lan-
language of the inter-subjective understanding is addressed to the individual's environment. In thinking, language takes the opposite direction because it is a matter of subjective understanding. In the synthesis of language and thought new forms of awareness arise that are uniquely human. This development is dialectically linked to the development of human self-awareness.

These forms of consciousness may be divided into discussional, aesthetic and syncretic forms of semiotic thinking. These forms of thought cannot be understood isolatedly, but must, as human mental processes in general, be understood as different aspects of an integrated intra-psycho-social system. As a result of the internalization\(^2\) of cultural languages, language develops into a structural coupling of social and mental systems. By intranalization of language, language is transformed into a structural coupling between affective and analytic systems in intra-psycho-social systems.\(^3\)

As a consequence of the development of semiotic thinking externally controlled behaviour is gradually replaced by internally controlled actions. Language becomes a tool of reflection that makes it possible to think about language as a tool for communication. Human semiotic thinking is connected both to communicative and practical actions. The development of semiotic thinking does not replace, but is dialectically connected to, the development of man's practical intelligence.

The internalization and intranalization of semiotic thinking are dialectically linked to the development of human intellect. The complexity in the ontogeny of man, implies that man’s intelligence is becoming more unique compared to the variations in human intelligence as a whole. Common to all developments of intelligence is that it occurs in the dialectic between reproduction and creativity. This reproduction and creativity are expressed in man’s practical and communicative acts.

The capacity for semiotic thinking is mediated (in the terminology of Vygotsky) by socio-cultural activities. The difference between mediation and disciplining is that mediation is based on meaningful activities. Learning comes before development. This means that any mediation requires some form of disciplining. The development of semiotic thinking is related to human development as a whole. This development is always based on man's level of development at the relevant time.

The definition of music education theory

Theories of music education may be described as inter-related hypotheses and postulates underlying descriptions, explanations and evaluations regarding the preparation of pedagogical music activities. These theories typically

\(^2\) *Internalization* refers to Jean Piaget’s concept *assimilation*, i.e. the establishment of a general conception (Piaget 2008). *Intranalization* is a new concept that refers to accommodation, that is, the mental interiorisation that is effected by the progressive reconstruction of the intra-psychological function of language.
refer to a more or less explicit perspective on music. Such a theory may be viewed on the one hand as a *supra-individual object* that exists in objective reality and on the other hand as an *individual theory* that exists in the consciousness of individuals. Music-education theories may thus be said to have an objective and a subjective existence.

The building blocks of music education theory are music-pedagogical concepts. These concepts may be scientific in the sense that they belong to various scientific disciplines. A music-pedagogical concept works both as a tool and as a symbol in the mediation of music teaching skills. Music-education theories are *internalized* and *intranalized* as individual theories through the communication that takes place in educational practice. That is, new music teaching awareness is created in the reproduction of existing knowledge.

The term theories-in-practice in music-pedagogic discourse means music-pedagogical concepts, assumptions and postulates that are used more or less uncritically in the actual practice of preparing musical activities. In theories-in-practice music-education concepts can figure as potential concepts. Although these concepts frequently are taken from scientific discourses their theoretical charge compared to those of scientific concepts is diffuse.

Music-pedagogical concepts can also function as pseudo-concepts not related to theories of music education. Unlike the potential concept, the meaning of music-pedagogical pseudo-concepts is founded on folk-psychological narratives. Music–pedagogical pseudo-concepts can also be described as everyday concepts. The connection between assumptions, statements and questions based on everyday concepts may be expressed as narrative.

The concept *music education meta-theory* refers to theories that describe and problematize the planning of the practice of music-education. These theories are to a great extent based on scientific concepts. An authentic music-pedagogical concept is not fixed to a scientific paradigm, but to critical thinking. It is also characterised by the fact that it is rooted in practical experience of music and music education.

*The definition of music-pedagogical power of definition*

Music-pedagogical power of definition can be described as the semiotic thinking that is connected to the ability to prepare learning that is based on the knowledge and interests of the teacher and on the musical capabilities of the participants. The music-pedagogical power of definition develops through reflection and meta-reflection on various aspects of musical learning and development. These reflections involve both verbal and aesthetic forms of semiotic thinking.

Through *internalization* the practical function of a music-pedagogical concept will be reconstructed in music-pedagogical discourses as meaningful

---

4 This concept is taken from Jerome Bruner’s discussion about acts of meaning (Bruner 1999).
in intra-psychological systems. By *intranalization* the meaning of a music-pedagogical concept is liberated from its use in the practical situation that may be current. By intranalization the essential meaning of music-pedagogical concepts is generated in the dialectical clash of their inter-psychological and intra-psychological meanings.

Music-pedagogical power of definition is a matter not only of awareness of the learning situation, but also of the ability to act strategically from this awareness. Reflections and meta-reflections on the development of musical knowledge are not just about the transfer of knowledge, but also about the context of the transfer. Even if these aspects of learning cannot be separated in practice, they represent two different kinds of problem.

In mediation, music-pedagogical powers of definition can be seen as an aspect of music-pedagogical skill. The reflections of pedagogues on the musical capabilities of pupils are not only a result of their practical musical competence but also of their music-pedagogical skills. These skills embrace, for example, the knowledge of musical genres, technical skills, musical expression and the ability to communicate music.

The context of mediation is characterised by conditions that are material, administrative and related to questions of educational policy. The music-pedagogical power of definition is thus the ability to grasp these conditions and develop strategies for dealing with them.. In mediation, music-pedagogical powers of definition include, among other things, educational and artistic powers of definition. The educational power of definition includes a preferential right of interpretation of the design of musical learning. The artistic power of definition includes a preferential right of interpretation of the aesthetics.

### 6 The participants’ capabilities for musical development

In the initial stages of the research the background-study aimed to investigate what characterises the capabilities for musical learning and development in people with severe cognitive dysfunctions. In connection with the demarcation and specification of this problem the study acquired an enhanced music-ethnological profile. The analysis of the local music-culture under study resulted in a more nuanced picture of its practice. This was the study's main contribution to the research project as a whole.

The background-study was defined and analysed from a cultural-historical perspective. From this perspective, the participants' cognitive dysfunctions may be considered as natural variations, which entail special prerequisites for learning as well as for musical development. The basis of this analysis was how the participants' actual level of development and nearest zone for development could be defined in relation to the target group's diverse proto-
musical capabilities. Here the issue of proto-musicality was limited to musical attunement.\(^5\)

The analysis here is based on the assumption that musical knowledge is mediated through musical interaction. The data collection consisted of a combination of unstructured and structured observations. The results of these observations were summarised as narrative portraits of the individual participants. These portraits were discussed and confirmed by the pedagogues participating in the music culture under study.

Analysis showed that the capabilities for musical learning and development varied considerably among the participants in the study. These variations were certainly larger than expected but were not unexpected. On the other hand the complexity and diversity of musical learning and development that the results show was surprising. The background-study did not confirm the hypothesis that a natural proto-musicality develops through communication.

The results indicate that people with severe cognitive dysfunctions in general have a great potential to develop their musical action-competence. Musical interactions require musical initiative. The actors in musical interactions seem to interact out of differing interests and knowledge. Three of the participants showed no form of musical reaction in the musical sessions. This result was greatly unexpected, and the study failed to confirm that all humans are predisposed to musical attunement.

7 About conceptualizing on the part of pedagogues.

The aim of this sub-study was to generate data about the importance that the conceptualization of music-activities in practice may have for the connection between music education theory and the power of definition in music education. The study also focused on the question of how the of social workers’ perspective on music relates to how they experience music activities in their own practice.

The sub-study grew in a dialectical relationship to the problem-oriented development of the research as a whole. The thesis of language as a structural bridge between social and psychological systems constitutes the link between the sub-study’s results and the research question. The conclusion is partly based on an analysis of the effect that the informants' conceptualization of their perspectives on music had on their perspective on musical activities in their own practice.

The study of the social workers' conceptualization was mainly based on the ideas of communication contained in music education theory. The connection exists in the fact that music-education theories find expression in discusional practice. In relation to the concept of music education theory

---

5 This concept is taken from Kirsten Fink Jensen’s study of aesthetic learning (Fink-Jensen 1998).
language can be understood as the structural coupling between social and intra-psychological systems, whereas in relation to the concept of competence, language can be understood as the structural coupling between affective and analytical forms of thought in an intra-psychological system.

Data collection was based on group-interviews with pedagogical staff who participated in the musical activities in the background study. These interviews were designed to acquire knowledge about the informants’ perspectives on music based on their reflections, that is, the perspective on music manifested in the conversation about music. To ensure the scientific correctness of the sub-study, the informants were given the opportunity to comment on and correct the analysis and results.

Underlying the analysis is a cultural-historical distinction between *in-practice-theories* and *narratives* derived from practical experience. The results confirmed the hypothesis that the perspective on music held by social workers is largely something of which they are not consciously aware and is expressed in the form of narratives, told in the manner of everyday psychology, about music and musicality. The degree of self-awareness varied among the informants. Some paradoxical statements indicated that the informants' discussional statements are not always consistent in their understanding of themselves as practical players.

The sub-study concludes that the paradoxes that arise when the informant’s perspectives on music are conceptualised through conversation are dealt with using different strategies. One way is for the paradox to be ignored. However, the paradox can also give rise to different stances based on the informant’s own practical experiences and reflections about them. The paradox can finally be resolved by meta-reflection, that is, the social workers' critical questioning of the validity of his/her own every-day opinion.

8 About music therapists’ use of concepts

The purpose of the second sub-study was to generate data about what impact the use of music-pedagogical concepts may have in view of the relationship between music education theory and the power of definition in the practice of music pedagogy. This purpose in turn underlies the question of which concepts music-therapists use in their meta-reflections on musical situations.

The sub-study was linked dialectically to the problem-oriented development of the research as a whole. The link between the sub-study’s results and the research question is based on the thesis that language constitutes a structural coupling between social and psychological systems. The conclusion was partly derived from the analysis of what impact variations in the respondents' terminology had on their meta-reflections.

The choice of music therapists as respondents was made on the assumption that they can express their thoughts using academic concepts and theories that can be related to an explicit perspective on music. The analysis of the respondents' use of concept was, among other things, based on the dis-
tinction between potential concepts, scientific concepts and authentic concepts. The sub-study drew my attention to issues about the relationship between respondents' artistic and discussional practices.

The collection of data was based on a combination of interviews and the use of case studies. It was designed to achieve knowledge of respondents' spontaneous use of concepts as opposed to the transparency of their perspective on music. For this reason the reliability of the results could not be verified by a follow-up with the participating music therapists. Thus, the results were endorsed by research colleagues at the Royal College of Music in Stockholm.

The results confirmed the hypothesis that music-therapists with a university education analyse music situations in special-educational practice from a meta-perspective. The respondents did not use the same concepts when expressing their thoughts. The results also showed significant differences in their understanding and interpretation of the case presented. These diversities were expressed as three different types of music-therapists; the Musician, the Researcher and the Psychologist.

A conclusion of the sub-study is that variations in music-education terminology are not essential for how music situations may be perceived. The variations in the respondents' perceptions seem rather to be based on the discussional stance they take in their respective social practice. In contrast, the results indicate that the force contained in music-theoretical concepts appears to have an impact on how music situations are interpreted. The study also indicates that musical experiences and mental reflection are fundamental zones of meaning in authentic music-education concepts. This is related to the fact that scientific music concepts must stem from musical experiences if they are not to become empty abstractions.

9 Discussions and Conclusion

As described in the definitions in Chapter 5, a music education theory can be perceived as a supra-individual object that exists in an objective reality. Through the communication that takes place in discursive practice, music education theories are internalized and intranализed to become individual theories. A music education theory can thus be said to have both an objective and a subjective existence.

The music-pedagogical power of definition can be described as the semiotic thinking that is connected to the pedagogue’s ability to prepare learning situations from the starting-point of his/her own interests and knowledge and the participants' musical capabilities. The music-pedagogical power of definition is not just awareness of the learning situation, but also the ability to act strategically from this awareness.

This chapter discusses how the relationship between music education theory and the power of definition can be understood from the results and conclusions of the sub-studies. Three topics are raised about the rationality,
authenticity, and legitimacy of music education theories in relation to the music-pedagogical power of definition. The chapter ends with summarised conclusions.

About the rationality of music-education theories
Three of the participants in the background study showed no form of musical reaction that could constitute the basis of musical learning and development (chapter 6). The premises that are the foundation of a theoretical paradigm imply, however, a limitation of the theoretical force of the concepts in the paradigm. Consequently, the background-study does not describe the capabilities of the target group from an objective perspective. The study centres on the question of how these capabilities can be described objectively in a pragmatic cultural-historical approach.

This raises a problem concerning the effects of the rationality of music-education theories. Instead of contributing to a better understanding of the development of musical knowledge the theories can contribute to various processes of exclusion. Consideration must therefore be given to this at the same time as it is given to the pedagogue’s understanding of his/her own musical competence as well as the ability to identify the target groups’ capabilities of learning through music.

About the authenticity of music-education theories
Music-theoretical concepts can be used to legitimise a music-pedagogical practice (chapter 7). Although musical activities can be described in detail with music-pedagogical concepts that are used in practice, it is not certain that these descriptions can explain the development of musical knowledge. This kind of uncritical use of theoretical concepts in the conceptualisation of practices does not necessarily lead to a greater music-pedagogical power of definition.

This raises a question of who possesses the power of definition over the practice - the researcher or the practitioner. The ultimate consequence of a philosophical hegemony in a local music-pedagogical discourse would be that music education theory could seem like a list of ready answers rather than a tool for pedagogical reflection.

About the validity of music-education theories
The synthesis of discussional and aesthetic zones of meaning, which constitute the significance of authentic music-education concepts, is a prerequisite if music-pedagogical meta-reflections are to be meaningful (chapter 8). The perspective on music that makes it possible to participate in critical discussions of musical learning and development must therefore be related to musical experience.

This raises a problem about the validity of music-education research in the critical discussion of musical learning in the field of pedagogical prac-
Music-pedagogical concepts are very complex and therefore can never be considered as ultimately defined. In this context, the music-pedagogical power of definition could perhaps be described as the ability of a pedagogue to question the validity of music-education theories on the basis of his/her own pedagogical and musical experience.

**Conclusions**

The results and conclusions of the sub-studies make it possible to draw two conclusions regarding how the relationship between music education theory and the power of definition can be described and problematized from a cultural-historical perspective.

The first conclusion is that the music education theory can be understood as a structural coupling of the power of definition in music-pedagogical discourses as a whole and the pedagogues' music-pedagogical power of definition. Although a music education theory might have a high scientific reliability, its rationality, authenticity and validity can limit the pedagogues' music-pedagogical power of definition.

The second conclusion is that the development of the music-pedagogical power of definition is a creative process based on critical questioning. It is only when music-pedagogical concepts, theses and hypotheses are released from their inter-psychological meaning that they became a tool for reflection.

**10 Final discussion**

The thesis ends with a short discussion about how the results of the study can be described and problematized in relation to the *genealogy of power* and *government*. These concepts have been taken from Michel Foucault's works (Foucault 2001, 2008b, 2009). A central concept in this discussion is *musical pedagogical action competence*. This notion is meant to conceptualise the connection between a pedagogue's pedagogical power of definition and his/her musical action competence. The aim of raising the issue of musical pedagogical action competence in the analytical perspective of academic discourse is to identify some possible areas for further research into the music-pedagogical power of definition.
Referenser

Tryckt litteratur


Internetreferenser


